

University of Northern Colorado

UNCOpen

Master's Theses

Student Work

8-1-2024

More Than Windows and Mirrors: Using Culturally Responsive Teaching in Conjunction with Project Based Learning

Victoria DiMarzio

University of Northern Colorado

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digscholarship.unco.edu/theses>



Part of the [Music Education Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

DiMarzio, Victoria, "More Than Windows and Mirrors: Using Culturally Responsive Teaching in Conjunction with Project Based Learning" (2024). *Master's Theses*. 319.

<https://digscholarship.unco.edu/theses/319>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Work at UNCOpen. It has been accepted for inclusion in Master's Theses by an authorized administrator of UNCOpen. For more information, please contact Nicole.Webber@unco.edu.

UNIVERSITY OF NORTHERN COLORADO

Greeley, Colorado

The Graduate School

MORE THAN WINDOWS AND MIRRORS: USING CULTURALLY
RESPONSIVE TEACHING IN CONJUNCTION
WITH PROJECT BASED LEARNING

A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree of
Master of Music

Victoria Lynn DiMarzio

College of Performing & Visual Arts
School of Music
Music Education

August 2024

This Thesis by: Victoria Lynn DiMarzio

Entitled: *More Than Windows and Mirrors: Using Culturally Responsive Teaching in Conjunction with Project Based Learning*

has been approved as meeting the requirements of the Degree of Master of Music in College of Performing and Visual Arts in School of Music, Music Education.

Accepted by the Thesis Committee:

Kristina Weimer, Ph.D., Chair

Lindsay Fulcher, Ph.D., Committee Member

Accepted by the Graduate School

Jeri-Anne Lyons, Ph.D.
Dean of the Graduate School
Associate Vice President for Research

ABSTRACT

DiMarzio, Victoria Lynn. *More Than Windows and Mirrors: Using Culturally Responsive Teaching in Conjunction with Project Based Learning*. Unpublished Master of Music thesis, University of Northern Colorado, 2024

This qualitative action research project examined the connections between broadening students' cultural perspectives and student voice and choice while students explored how multicultural arrangements can be authentic and valuable to a student's music education. The following research questions were

- Q1 How do students perceive world music arrangements?
- Q2 How will participation in this project impact students' sense of belonging in music class?
- Q3 How do musicians and music educators determine if arrangements are appropriate to use/perform?

The purpose of this study was to explore students' perception of world music arrangements, their sense of belonging in instrumental (band and orchestra) music class and create criteria to assist other music educators and students to determine the appropriateness of multicultural band and orchestra arrangements. Thirteen eighth grade students participated in this action research study. By sharing the process of repertoire research and selection, students improved skills in musical analysis, expressed feelings of belonging in the class, and expanded their musical horizons by learning about a broad spectrum of musical cultures.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I	1
INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER II.....	2
REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE	2
Culturally Responsive Pedagogy	2
Developing Culturally Responsive Teaching.....	3
Culturally Responsive Teaching in Action	4
Culturally Responsive Teaching Misinterpreted.....	6
Need for the Study.....	9
Summary of Related Literature	10
Purpose of the Study	11
CHAPTER III	12
METHODOLOGY	12
Study Design	12
School Setting and Participants.....	13
Procedures	13
Data Gathering and Analysis Tools	17
CHAPTER IV	19
FINDINGS	19
Perception of World Music Arrangements.....	19
Students’ Sense of Belonging and Empowerment	21
Determining Music Appropriateness	23
CHAPTER V	25
DISCUSSION	25
REFERENCES	30
APPENDIX A.....	35

INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD LETTER, RECRUITMENT AND CONSENT LETTERS.....	35
APPENDIX B.....	43
LANGUAGE SUPPORTS.....	43
APPENDIX C.....	46
STUDENT WORK TEMPLATES AND DATA COLLECTION	46
APPENDIX D.....	54
FINAL PROJECT TEMPLATE	54

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Since the Tanglewood Symposium of 1967, music educators have taken strides to move beyond just the Western canon, and show respect for folk, pop, and cultural music from around the world. At this symposium musicians, educators, sociologists, and other stakeholders came together and created a declaration with eight statements which provided a philosophical foundation for music education. The second statement was a need for a more expansive and diverse curriculum. As a result of this philosophical aspiration, there was a shift in pedagogical approach that included implementing multicultural music (Volk, 1993). In the 1970s, multicultural resources were largely basic information about world music from an outsider's perspective being shared in publications such as the *Music Educators Journal*. Overall, there were limited resources and little training available to implement multicultural teaching. By the 1980s a shift to teaching from a multicultural lens came into focus, with training available in the form of conferences, community learning, and reading sessions (Volk, 1993). In the 21st century implementing multicultural music shifted to culturally responsive education.

CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

I focused on literature describing Culturally Responsive Teaching and Project Based Learning, and the outcomes of the philosophy and outcomes of these two teaching pedagogies. Literature on Culturally Responsive Teaching (CRT) reviews what skills and attitudes teachers have when they are successful in this way of teaching, and also highlights some pitfalls of not being culturally responsive. The Project Based Learning (PBL) literature shows how this process increases student engagement in the subject and their understanding of content.

Culturally Responsive Pedagogy

Gloria Ladson-Billings (1995b) coined the term *culturally responsive pedagogy* and stated that it has three criteria: “(a) Students must experience academic success; (b) students must develop and/or maintain cultural competence; and (c) students must develop a critical consciousness through which they challenge the status quo of the current social order” (p. 160). At the time, she noted that much of the work on improving the school culture for African American students sought to improve their self-esteem, and pointed out that academic success was pivotal to that improvement. Her second point referred to the issue of academically successful African American students being ousted from their community for “acting White” (p. 160). She stated that culturally responsive teachers leveraged student culture to bring them into the academic circle, such as teachers using rap lyrics to learn poetry. Culturally responsive teaching (CRT) uses student’s own background knowledge, understanding, and meaning-making

schematics to leverage new learning. Teachers that taught in a culturally responsive way held all students to high standards and provided scaffolds and entry points to help those that needed it. Most importantly, she found that these culturally responsive teachers believed themselves to be part of the community and relished the artistry of teaching. Additionally, she found that culturally responsive teachers believe that not only can all students succeed, but it is their job to guarantee they do.

Culturally responsive teaching is not a collection of strategies, but a way of being and thinking about education (Hammond, 2014). When diving into CRT, some teachers may be tempted to look for the checklist, or tricks of the trade. However, none of those things would be helpful if the teacher still has a fundamental belief that certain students can only achieve certain levels, or that it is a child's fault for not understanding. CRT is a mindset centered around how you can organize your teaching to help everyone in your class succeed. It is a way to plan to use students' culture and schema to leverage new understanding.

Developing Culturally Responsive Teaching

Gay (2002) described five elements of culturally responsive teaching: 1) developing a knowledge base about cultural diversity, 2) including ethnic and cultural diversity content in the curriculum, 3) demonstrating caring and building learning communities, 4) communicating with ethnically diverse students, and 5) responding to ethnic diversity in the delivery of instruction (p. 106). As educators, it is our job to dive into students' backgrounds to help build bridges from what they know to what they need to know in our curriculum. Many articles and books on CRT reference going into the world outside the classroom to build this knowledge (Emdin, 2016; Ladson-Billings, 1995a). Attending outside music performances in which our students participate, their non-music extracurricular activities like sports and theater, and their church

services (Emdin, 2016) are all excellent starting points for developing the mind-set of culturally responsive teaching.

Culturally Responsive Teaching in Action

Shaw (2015) followed four community choir teachers, and found they all had strong personal practical knowledge that led them to have open dispositions towards cultural diversity, a desire to know all students' cultural backgrounds, and worked to "not essentialize culture by assuming that all people belonging to a social category were culturally similar (see F. Erickson, 2005), nor did they assume any single musical tradition was representative of or relevant to all people" (p. 201). Shaw (2016) found that culturally competent teachers who taught community choirs believed cultural diversity was an asset, and actively planned for using it in the curriculum. "Conversations with and observations of teachers revealed that their instruction was informed by and responsive to the cultural diversity present in their classrooms" (p. 280).

Irizarry and Raible (2011) found that teachers whom the community had identified as effective at teaching Latino students actively worked against being "color blind" (p. 201) and very intentionally sought to understand their students, and how the teachers' own identities worked in each context. While this study corroborates other's evidence of teachers needing to have socio-cultural competency, it is interesting to note that neither researchers nor community participants offered any criteria for what made a socio-culturally competent teacher.

To avoid stereotyping cultural music, teachers must develop socio-cultural understandings, work to provide a wide variety in musical offerings, and attend "to cultural validity" (Shaw, 2016, p. 285). Cultural validity, as opposed to authenticity, recognizes that not all music can be replicated authentically in every situation. If those learning about the music of a particular culture are not from said culture, are not in the setting of the original music, are not

using the intended original instruments, and/or not using the original language, it can be argued the music will never be authentic. The question of validity comes to how far from the original one can sway before it becomes something else entirely (Abril, 2006). Students are acutely aware of teachers' attempts at honoring culture and musical diversity, while also not wanting to be put into boxes. Not all Hispanic students may feel respected and honored if their only "in" with music is a Mariachi ensemble. All students want to know a wide variety of music, because they do not want to be ignorant or feel left out of other opportunities for learning and performing (Shaw, 2016).

Prest et al. (2023) examined how one school district in British Columbia embedded culturally diverse music in their curriculum. Policy changes required them to embed local Indigenous knowledge and worldviews into all subject areas. To meet these standards, they collaborated with local Indigenous groups, commissioned new music, and examined cultural differences. Findings revealed an understanding that not all music is for everyone, and that authentically engaging in culture-sharing may mean resisting integrating one form into another. The researchers identified four ways to imbue the curriculum with Indigenous music. The first is Integrative and is how much of the modern multicultural repertoire works today. We make the 'other' music fit in with Western style, instrumentation, and aesthetic, which leads to inauthentic listening. This can fit Abramo's (2007) definition of cultural violence by making music pleasing to Western tastes and ignoring any implications of interpretation. Second is Nation-to-Nation trading, which offers the performers and audience members a chance to compare the process and performance of two differing cultures. Third is Combinator, which offers a chance for Western elements to enter the global sound, such as a clarinet playing the melody. This may look like Integrative, but the key difference is involving culture bearers in creating new musical

compositions and following Indigenous protocols or global perspective. The fourth is Non-Integrative, which says we do not need to try to fit one culture into the mold of another. The result for any choice of sharing differences must be respect and honor for the culture being taught.

Culturally Responsive Teaching Misinterpreted

In the early 2000s a movement towards authenticity became apparent, but there were still trappings of trying to make things fit into Western traditions. Abramo (2007) argued that rather than celebrating diversity, multicultural band music promoted racial and cultural stereotyping, and continued an othering of non-Western music styles and practices. Music educators have lofty goals of global harmony through music practice and performance, but Abramo worried that we further entrenched differences by viewing musical diversity through White eyes. Simply providing multicultural music examples or works written by people who are not culture bearers can misrepresent a culture and be actively harmful to students' identity and sense of self in the classroom.

Fitzpatrick (2012) examined how culturally responsive education could help identity and self-relationship. She noted that teachers from a different background than their students tend to assume their own culture is "normal" and their students' background is "abnormal" which leads to deficit-minded teaching. This deficit-mindedness can lead to invalid representations of pop, folk, and world music. "Multicultural content in and of itself does not necessarily lead to increased cultural competency or to forging a better alignment between home and school life for our students" (p. 57). Related, Gurgel (2019) suggested that some attempts made to incorporate a variety of music can be done inauthentically, since Western European standards and traditions are more highly valued. This leads to arrangements and transcriptions that lose their intrinsic

value by becoming static, taught in inauthentic ways, and eliminate the possibility of collaboration.

I have personally attended clinics at music education conferences where colleagues suggest CRT can mean using non-Western musical examples, programming non-White composers, or even adding a Mariachi ensemble to your course offerings. Lind and McKoy (2016) noted this trend:

When we talk about culturally responsive pedagogy, people's first reaction tends to center around music choices. While we do see a value in expanding the types of music used for instruction, including world music, or focusing on pop and hip hop is not necessarily the answer. (p. 96)

While these are well-intended, and some should be considered necessary curricular steps, they do not truly encompass what CRT set out to achieve. Teachers must incorporate a wide variety of musical styles, histories, and traditions, which could include adding Mariachi ensembles, or multicultural music. However, a pitfall of many Western trained and European centered programs is picking "multicultural" music without a clear lens. Abramo (2007) warned that multicultural music can lead to racial violence if not done with proper sensitivity. So, while incorporating a diverse repertoire is an element of culturally responsive pedagogy, teachers must go a step further to program with intentionality and involve students in the creation of curriculum to develop students' autonomy over their own learning to fully embrace the pedagogy of culturally responsive education.

In the early 2000s, many teachers became aware of their school and community's changing demographics and made curriculum changes and class offerings to be more diverse. Abril (2006) examined one teacher whose school had an increased Hispanic population, although

her band program remained majority White students. She added a Mariachi ensemble in hopes of recruiting more students to music. However, she was not well trained in Mariachi music and lacked many cultural competencies to properly address the tensions between herself as a White woman and her Hispanic students. Students noted her lack of content mastery and lack of self-awareness regarding her own privilege and positioning in the class.

Carlow (2016) conducted a case study of English Language Learners (ELL) in choir to understand ELL students' perceptions of participating in high school choir, and any possible tensions between socio-cultural traditions of the American choral program and the students' previous music education. The teacher did not know one of her students was Russian, and the student was highly aware of this lack of cultural acknowledgement. The student, Irina, was a Russian immigrant of Korean background, who had experience in choral settings in her homeland. She lit up a stage at the talent show, singing a Russian pop song. But in choir class, she disengaged, saying her teacher would "diss" her class as not being as good as the other choir, and didn't select good songs for them to sing (p. 73). Since this teacher had little idea of her student's background, or even how musical the student was, she had no idea how to actively engage her in class. Despite her student being familiar with the norms and processes of choral class, as they were similar to her previous education, since she did not feel seen or welcomed to the class, she regularly sat in rehearsal without participating. Carlow noted that "music educators must begin to acknowledge that students' previous experiential backgrounds provide both a point of departure and an anchor for new learning" (p. 75). Teachers need cultural competency and respect for diverse cultures before multicultural music offerings can be culturally relevant.

Need for the Study

Previous studies of CRT focus on changing the teacher's perspective (Emdin, 2016; Erickson, 2005; Gay, 2002; Hammond, 2014; Irizarry & Raible, 2011) and models for how they will prepare and deliver instruction (Prest et al., 2023; Shaw, 2015, 2016). My philosophy is that students are not empty vessels needing to be filled by the teacher; they have vast background knowledge and expertise that can leverage learning in the classroom. In the 21st century, merely acknowledging students' diverse identities is not enough to engage and welcome students into learning. They deserve to see themselves in the curriculum and to feel their identity and knowledge are valuable and essential in the world. Positioning them as experts can create an environment of joy and inquiry, leading to deeper understanding and sense of community.

I wondered what CRT would look like if I flipped the classroom to student-led inquiry using a project-based learning model; one where students engaged in the process of evaluating multicultural music arrangements and developing understanding of cultural competency. Project based learning (PBL) is a research-based learning technique in which students work to solve a real-world problem or answer a question, and present their solution to the community (Almulla, 2020; Blumenfeld et al., 1991). The solution can come in the form of artifacts such as models and reports, or products, and they answer the driving question of the project. Studies have shown that using the project-based learning model increases student motivation and engagement (Almulla, 2020; Blumenfeld et al., 1991; Geier et al., 2008; Ozkan, 2023), increases understanding of content (Blumenfeld et al., 1991; Ozkan, 2023), and stronger development of skills like synthesizing, analyzing, and transfer (Ozkan, 2023).

Project based learning implements the Gold Standard (PBL Works, 2023) to evaluate quality of a project, and ensure students can get the most out of their projects. The Gold Standard

has seven criteria: 1) a challenging problem or question, 2) sustained inquiry, 3) authenticity, 4) student voice and choice, 5) reflection, 6) critique and revision, and 7) public product. Evans (2019) examined a New Hampshire science teacher implementing Gold Standard criteria and found that academics improved, with 62% of students scoring proficient or above on a culminating task. Success skills were also high; 71% of students scored proficient or above in collaboration skills, and 83% demonstrated proficient or above self-direction skills. Sahli (2017) examined Measures of Academic Progress (MAP) growth scores by comparing students in a traditional classroom setting to a PBL setting and found that students achieved higher in math and reading scores in the PBL setting. PBL is typically associated with subjects such as math and science, but the results were similar in a visual arts classroom. Ozkan (2023) found pretest to post-test growth was evident with a PBL process compared to a traditional classroom setting. Students in the PBL model had significant differences in understanding of content, research skills, and more positive attitude towards the subject matter.

As a result, developing research skills in the visual arts lesson enables students to develop the skills of collecting, analyzing and synthesizing information and materials that they will use in their artistic productions. It also improves students' critical thinking, problem solving and aesthetic evaluation skills. (p. 369)

Putting students in the driver's seat of their own education has a significant impact on learning, success skills, and their perceptions of learning.

Summary of Related Literature

As evidenced in the literature, Culturally Responsive Teaching is a way of thinking and preparing classes, not necessarily a tip or trick to engage students. Teachers that are most successful with diverse groups of students intentionally plan for the differences of their students

and consider each student's background as valuable knowledge to build upon. In music education, it sometimes requires teachers to step away from their personal lens of how music should be studied or performed and understand the cultural context of how and why different performance practices are used. It also shows that Project Based Learning is an effective classroom model to increase student engagement in the learning process and increase student understanding of content.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to explore students' perception of world music arrangements, their sense of belonging in instrumental (band and orchestra) music class and create criteria to assist other music educators and students to determine the appropriateness of multicultural band and orchestra arrangements. Research questions were

- Q1 How do students perceive world music arrangements?
- Q2 How will participation in this project impact students' sense of belonging in music class?
- Q3 How do musicians and music educators determine if arrangements are appropriate to use/perform?

CHAPTER III
METHODOLOGY
Study Design

I used action research to engage teacher and students in a cycle of reflective inquiry on multicultural repertoire. Action research is an approach educators use to look at practice problems with intentionality in a formalized way to find solutions. Action research can be quantitative or qualitative, and differs from mere reflection on practice, as there needs to be cycles of looking, thinking and acting on the findings (Miksza et al., 2023). In this research, cycles included (1) examining students' understanding of cultural appropriation, world music, and their sense of belonging, (2) adjusting lessons and instruction throughout the project, and finally (3) re-evaluating students' understanding and sense of belonging. I went through the University Institution Review Board process (IRB) for research on human subjects, and was determined to have an exemption under 45 CFR 46.104(d)(701) (702) for research involving Category 2 (2018): EDUCATIONAL TESTS, SURVEYS, INTERVIEWS, OR OBSERVATIONS OF PUBLIC BEHAVIOR (see Appendix A). All eighth-grade music students ($n = 35$) were invited to participate in this study via a letter sent to families describing the study and participation expectations. Another letter was sent home later to attain consent, which both student and parents signed in order to participate in the study (see Appendix A).

School Setting and Participants

This study took place in an urban school in a large metropolitan district in the Western United States. At the time of this study, the school had three magnet programs designed for students of diverse backgrounds and needs: 1) the Newcomer program, for non-English speaking immigrant students with interrupted education backgrounds; 2) the Multiple Intensive/Severe (MIS) program for students with special needs; and, 3) the Pragmatic Language and Executive Functioning (PLEX) program, for students on the autism spectrum. Demographically, the school population was approximately 58% white students, 25% Hispanic students, 7% Black or African American students, 4% Asian students and 4% students of two or more races. Approximately 38% of students qualified for the free and reduced lunch program.

Students could take two electives each day. The music electives offered were eighth grade band and combined seventh/eighth grade orchestra. Twenty students were enrolled in eighth grade band and thirty were enrolled in the combined orchestra. Of those, three students elected to take both band and orchestra. The eighth-grade music classes reflected the overall student population; 26% of students were Hispanic, 11% were Black or African American, 2% were Asian, and 5% were two or more races. Additionally, 17% of the music students had one or more documented disability, and 20% were Multi-Language Learners (English was not their native language). While 35 students were invited to participate, 13 eighth-grade music students returned signed permission slips consenting to be part of the study.

Procedures

Throughout this four-week inquiry cycle, students individually and collectively examined multiple pieces of music categorized on music publishing websites as “multicultural” or otherwise marketed as specific to a particular world culture (such as “Latino” as found on J.W.

Pepper's website). Students were asked to be experts, sharing what they knew about various music and world cultures, researching what they did not know, and presenting their findings in the form of a flowchart and learning summary (see Appendix D).

The first lesson (week one) began with a discussion of appreciation versus appropriation, and the three major components of our project: 1) researching a genre/style of world music students were unfamiliar with, 2) analyzing arrangements of music at our class's playing ability that were meant to represent that same culture then discussing if it accurately represented the intended culture or if it stereotyped musical styles or created a biased sound, and 3) creating a flowchart to help us and other musicians determine if those arrangements are respectful and representative of a world culture, and therefore appropriate to perform. I created a vocabulary definition sheet with terms such as appreciation, appropriation, culture, tradition, and arrangement, to make the content accessible for all (see Appendix B). Students completed a pre-project questionnaire (see Appendix C), gauging their interest in learning about music from other cultures, their sense of belonging in class, and how important they believe it is to learn about music from other cultures.

In our second lesson (week two), students practiced describing music using content vocabulary (rhythm, style, instrumentation, etc.) while analyzing compositions specifically for our classes. In band class we used "The Tempest" (Smith, 1995) and we used "Dark Matter" in orchestra class (Taurins, 2023). They shared what instruments, articulations, harmonic style, and beat they heard, then sight read a "multicultural" piece. In band we read "African Sketches" (Curnow, 1992), and "Noche de Estrellas" (Caponegro, 2001) for orchestra. After playing, students analyzed the arrangement by describing the music using content vocabulary. We then listened to original music of the same culture- Maasai dancers from Kenya (John Johnson, 2017)

for band, and Cumbia (Carnegie Hall, n.d.) for orchestra. Students completed another style and instrumentation analysis, comparing what they heard in the originals to the arrangements. They then completed a Likert scale rating of whether or not we should ever perform the arrangements we sight-read, with 1 being we should never perform this composition/arrangement for any reason, and 4 being we should perform this composition/arrangement whenever we want, no questions asked.

In our third lesson (week two) we used Carnegie Hall's Music Explorers Digital (n.d.) to independently research music students were unfamiliar with. Students completed Research Note Catcher One, writing about the performer's musical background, influences on the performer's musical style, what instruments were used, and key stylistic features of the genre (see Appendix C). They then compared the music they researched to the music we typically play and were asked if it would be reasonable for us to play music in this style.

In the fourth lesson (week three) students searched for musical arrangements for our class that represented music from the culture they previously researched. This lesson was adjusted as a result of previous student work; they struggled with the idea that when music was arranged for their playing level, it became culturally inappropriate to play. They thought the music must sound exactly like the original music, and it had to be arranged or composed by a person from that particular culture 100% of the time. Therefore, the lesson began with a comparison of Irish fiddle music (peakfiddler, 2015) to an arrangement for our level orchestra, called "Irish Faire" (Newbold, 2008). Students were directed to listen for how it had similar meter (6/8 feel), rhythm patterns (long-short) and was mostly scale-like melody. I told them it would not sound exact, as it needed to be arranged for our musical level, but the "bones" of the structure were the same. They understood the musical structure and why it needed to be arranged for us. I asked them to

guess the arranger. No one guessed that it was Soon Hee Newbold, a South Korean-born American with no explicit cultural ties to Ireland. We discussed as a class if we still thought that a composer or arranger must be *from* the culture, or if there are caveats to that rule. Students then listened to “La Sortija” by (O’Brien, 2013) and researched this composer. They found that he is an ethnomusicologist with a specialization in Argentinian music, having studied there extensively. Students realized the importance of composers connecting to and understanding the music they arranged. For the final part of the lesson, students individually searched the music publishing websites J.W. Pepper, FJH music, and Hal Leonard, for arrangements of music they examined (see Appendix C). They completed Research Note Catcher Two, where they linked music they found, researched and wrote a short background on the composer, and listed if the key stylistic features of the arrangement matched that of the original music.

In the fifth lesson (week four) students completed a jigsaw read of four articles that described cultural appropriation. A jigsaw is a reading strategy that splits text into smaller groups for students to read and collaborate on understanding. Students were divided into four groups based on reading level and given one of the articles to read. In their like-ability group, students highlighted themes of the article, and took note of quotes they thought were important. Then to complete the jigsaw, students shuffled groups, so that there was one student representing each article in the new group. In this new group, students developed a shared definition of cultural appropriation, and shared important themes and quotes from their articles.

In the sixth lesson, students created their final project, the flowchart (see Appendix D). We reviewed what a flowchart is, how they function, then students individually created their own to help themselves and others determine if world cultural arrangements are appreciation or appropriation. They crafted definitions of cultural appreciation and cultural appropriation,

applied their flowchart to an arrangement they analyzed in a previous lesson, and reflected on their learning throughout the project. Finally, they completed the post-project questionnaire (see Appendix C), which asked the same questions as the first questionnaire.

Data Gathering and Analysis Tools

Data gathering occurred over a four-week period while also preparing for a performance. In the first week, students were given the pre-project questionnaire, and the first lesson on what the project would entail and important vocabulary for the project. Week two, we completed lessons two and three, in which students practiced describing music, compared global musical examples to Western arrangements, had a discussion about the arrangements, and completed the first portion of research for their project. In week three students completed lesson four, which included the second portion of research. Finally, in week four I delivered lessons five and six, and students completed their flowchart and post-project questionnaire.

I collected a pre- and post-project questionnaire to gauge students' understanding and interest in the topic. Questionnaire items were almost identical, both centered on student perceptions of world music and their sense of belonging in class before and after the project. I video recorded lesson two, and transcribed verbal and non-verbal responses from part of the lesson asking students to rate on a Likert scale by holding up their fingers. Finally, I collected student work, analyzing students' use of vocabulary, their responses, and how well they applied their knowledge to the final product.

Data collection and analysis occurred simultaneously to maintain a cycle of reflection and organization. I used organization categories to analyze and sort data as it was collected (Maxwell, 2013). Findings from the questionnaires, discussions, assignments, and student products (flowchart) and learning summaries were sorted by my research questions. As new data

were gathered, I made adjustments to lesson plans to address student misconceptions and adjusted the post questionnaire to include an item asking for student feedback on the project design. In the last reflective cycle, I finalized themes present in student work and questionnaire answers. I also used triangulation throughout data analysis (Carter et al., 2014).

CHAPTER IV

FINDINGS

Findings are presented in relation to each research question. Research questions were

- Q1 How do students perceive world music arrangements?
- Q2 How will participation in this project impact students' sense of belonging in music class?
- Q3 How do musicians and music educators determine if arrangements are appropriate to use/perform?

Through this project, I was able to see how students analyzed music and identified musical ideas, made judgements on quality of work, and became empowered with their new knowledge.

Perception of World Music Arrangements

Throughout this project students were asked to analyze music, make judgments about its quality, and connect musical ideas and works with societal, cultural, and historical context to understand relationships and influences. Students needed to hear distinct instrumentation, style, and other characteristics of original music and hear those characteristics in arrangements for their own ensembles. In Lesson Two students most often identified instrumentation and could make generalized descriptions with phrases such as “it has a melody and harmony” or “it has strong drum beats” (Research Note Catcher 1). At this point students struggled to articulate specific and distinct characteristics such as articulation, feel/meter, and modality, and ways to describe style. When they compared original works to the arrangements in the second lesson, most could identify that it sounded different, but struggled with specifying *how* it differed. After feedback, students' ability to describe stylistic characteristics somewhat improved as shown in their second

Research Note Catcher. One student was able to hear indirect connections, such as the original having strong drum beats, which was also represented in the bass part of the arrangement (Research Note Catcher 2). However, two other students left the stylistic features question blank. It is unclear if this was from lack of understanding or lack of motivation to complete the project.

In Lesson Three, students were shown examples of simplified arrangements that the teacher considered culturally appropriate, and then engaged in discussion about elements to look for when determining if an arrangement could be considered appropriate. In the second half of the lesson students were given time to research arrangements on their own. They used the websites JWPepper.com, fjhmusic.com and hal Leonard.com to find arrangements for our class based on their research into a particular culture in Lesson Two. They then completed Research Note Catcher Two to gather information on the arrangement, the composer/arranger, and describe the similarities and differences between the original music and the arrangement. Almost all participants were able to describe the composer's background and make inferences about whether they thought the composer had adequate knowledge and cultural understanding to be writing that music. One student commented about a composer's background, "no evidence they went there, but they have studied music extensively, so they probably know enough."

Research Note Catcher Two showed students' improved ability to describe stylistic elements of the music as compared to the previous assignment. In Lesson Two, students thought the instruments in the arrangement needed to be exactly like the instruments in the original work. Many students noted drum-heavy music is not enough like music made for orchestra. As a result, Lesson Three addressed how changes must be made when we are making music for our group. After this reteach, more students were able to connect stylistic elements from the original to the arrangements, despite them not having the exact instrumentation. One student found the bass

parts in the background similar to the drums of the original. Another strength in this assignment, as a result of the reteach, was that more students had strong stylistic descriptions, and they were confident making judgements about arrangements being accurate representations versus Western interpretations with no real connections to the original.

Students' Sense of Belonging and Empowerment

An important part of this project was to provide students opportunities to explore a more diverse musical repertoire, giving them a window into other worlds of music making. In the pre-project questionnaire, many students responded that they already felt they belonged. This sense of belonging ranged from enjoyment of class activities, saying, "I get to play," and "orchestra is fun no matter what we play." Others' sense of belonging came from feeling their voice was valued. Comments included "my voice is heard and my ideas and opinions are taken into account most of the time," and "being able to express my opinions and make great music alongside [*sic*] my peers." Others' sense of belonging came from the community, or how others in the class made them feel, "I feel like I can play and be comfortable here," "we all work together, making an inclusive environment [*sic*]," "nothing has made me feel like I shouldn't," and "everyone is nice." These were classes with a strong sense of community and joy from being able to make music together. Students felt valued and confident in their class participation.

When asked, "Do you think people can perform music of a different culture than their own? Why or why not?" all students answered affirmatively. Some responses focused only on the musical aspect, stating, "music is for everyone," and "it can support their education in music." Others focused on being aware of cultural difference and a need for cultural sensitivity, commenting "because it shows you learned and care about a different culture and how their music is," "because it is good to learn about other cultures and how their music may differ from

how music in their own culture might be played,” and “you are broadening your understanding of other cultures.” This project started strong with participants ready to learn about different cultures of music. Five students mentioned doing it respectfully, or needing to know the background before performing, with one saying specifically “don't be racist.”

In the post-project questionnaire, most students who responded indicated that their interest in and familiarity with global music remained high or increased, as did their belief that learning about global music is important. Two students noted that their perspectives changed, as they now believed understanding the music was more important than just performing it. Two other students noted that they need to be careful about what they play, and to do research and educate themselves about music from other cultures before performing it. Students already believed that learning about music from other cultures was important, and that you should be respectful doing it, but they could now articulate how to be respectful. By putting students through a similar process that I use to examine music—studying its origins and listening with a critical ear for authenticity and teachability—students deepened their understanding of why certain repertoire choices were made.

Students did not believe that what they learned should be contained to our class alone. One student felt empowered to stand up for cultures being misrepresented in musical experiences outside of class, writing:

This information has broadened my understanding of not only the music we play, but also other music that is played in musicals, movies, and other mainstream networks. By knowing the difference, I am able to stay enlightened to my own actions and other actions, in order to build a better future and stand up for cultures that are misrepresented.

Nearly every student mentioned the word “respect,” or a desire to not do harm. One student made a poignant quote: “music is a beautiful thing and music should be shared amongst everyone, and all cultures alike.” Another student agreed, saying “we should perform world music more often, as long as it is respectful, because ‘music is for everyone.’” A different student said: “all cultures are important and should be celebrated.” The common thread here is that exposure to all kinds of music is essential, and students appreciate a window into other musical experiences. The students now are thinking ahead to how this is applicable to their personal and musical lives. By participating in a project-based learning unit with a real-world problem, students were able to think beyond our classroom.

Determining Music Appropriateness

Students were tasked with creating a flowchart to help musicians and teachers determine if arrangements of global music were appropriate to play. The only formal guidelines were that there should be at least two levels of questions on the flowchart, and that it should have clear if/then flow. All students created their own questions and organized them as they saw fit. As a result, each flowchart varied in number of questions and directions for how to follow from start to finish. One student’s flow chart had only one question, and it related to composer background. Another student’s flowchart had two questions, but neither related to the content we had studied. Many flowcharts had two to three questions, but some were organized as independent questions rather than in a flow of “if yes/if no” or “then this/then that” structure.

While the organization of each flowchart differed, there were similarities in content. Nearly all students said that composer background is important, or that the composer needs to have done proper research prior to composing in global styles. Half of the students mentioned that the arrangement needed to sound similar [to the original] or have the right style. Four

students mentioned respect in some way and four noted that the arrangement needed proper instrumentation. Three students mentioned understanding the purpose of the original music and whether or not that music is appropriate to be used for entertainment. This connected to our work in the research phase, and in the jigsaw definition activity in Lesson Five. Students connected the musical qualities and described music and the definitions of appreciation and appropriation into their charts.

Overall, each flowchart connected with the central theme of the project, answering “When is it appropriate to perform music from another culture” despite variance in answer. This aligns with Project Based Learning, as there is not meant to be “one right answer” but instead an opportunity for students to make their own meaning and rise to the challenge of having broad interpretation. Had every student come up with the same questions and directions for their flowcharts, individual understanding and growth could not be on display so clearly.

CHAPTER V

DISCUSSION

The purpose of this study was to explore students' perception of world music arrangements, their sense of belonging in instrumental (band and orchestra) music class and create criteria to assist other music educators and students to determine the appropriateness of multicultural band and orchestra arrangements. Findings revealed that students were able to analyze and apply understanding of musical elements in various pieces, that they believed in cultural sensitivity and a need for respect in our actions as musicians, and that all styles and genres of music should be shared. Through the combination of culturally responsive education and Project Based Learning Gold Standard, students could engage in the discovery process on their own and self-direct their learning based on interests.

From the first lesson, students showed an interest in learning about music from various global cultures. The questionnaire responses showed that their initial perceptions were positive, that they had varying degrees of background knowledge on the subject, and overall thought it would be important to be respectful of others. The first two lessons demonstrated that students had limited skills in describing and classifying music aurally. They relied heavily on describing instrumentation but did not have the vocabulary or refined listening skills to put different musics into specific genres or styles. After addressing these gaps in lessons three and four, students used more specificity in their descriptions. They also became more curious about other factors in the arrangements, asking questions about the composers' backgrounds and purpose of the original

music. This showed they were absorbing the lessons and beginning to make their own judgements on the quality of arrangements. They were synthesizing the ideas from each research portion, the articles from the jigsaw, and their own background knowledge in order to come up with their final product- the flowchart.

From beginning to end, a common thread held true in the form of a core belief the students shared. That core belief was “respect.” This term appeared more often than any other in all data gathering materials. From the pre-project questionnaire, to discussions, to the reflection, to the post-project questionnaire, the theme of ‘treating everyone and all cultures of music as valuable’ rang clear. Throughout this project students believed that the most important part of the choices we make in music center on treating all music well. This was emphasized in the final reflections, where students expanded on their original thoughts of respect to include caution, warning others to do research and understand as much as you can before playing (Flowchart assignment). The kindness and cultural sensitivity of these young students was on display throughout this project. Their concern for others shone through as they encountered arrangements that did not emulate respect for another culture (Research Note Catcher 2).

Students also consistently expressed the belief that “music is for everyone.” This was evident throughout, in students repeating the same ideas in pre- and post-questionnaires, and in their final take-aways from the flowchart assignment. When responding to the question, “Do you think people can perform music of a different culture than their own,” students were able to give more nuanced answers in the post-project questionnaire. While still agreeing, they were able to make connections to our project, such as learning about the composer and their background, knowing elements of music to listen for in the music, and understanding the original purpose of the genre/style of music. Once again, they noted being respectful as an important part of the

process. Students had developed an understanding that context is a vital part of the repertoire selection process in regard to performing music from a culture different than their own.

Although there was a variety in students' flowchart questions, they were all able to connect their criteria to the Lesson Six outcomes. Students asked questions about composer background and context, which related to Lesson Four. Students asked questions about the original purpose of the music, which related to our first research lesson. Students asked questions about the style of the music, relating to our second lesson and all the research portions. By sustaining inquiry throughout the project (PBL Works, 2023) students were always focused on the end goal, understood the purpose of each part, and made lasting connections.

While many positives came from this project, there were also some challenges. Because we used only the Carnegie Hall Music Explorers (CHME), students were only able to research what was available on that site. This caused difficulty when students went to search for music written for their playing level. Not all the choices on CHME had leveled band or orchestral arrangements, which made the second part of the research process much more challenging. Some students recommended that the teacher provide more resources for research, so they could access more materials to examine. Providing more resources would allow more variety in cultures, and more information to help students analyze musical styles, techniques, and cultural significance of practices.

Students were directed to search for arrangements on their own using JWPepper.com, FJHmusic.com, and hal Leonard.com. Some had stronger search skills, leading to some students finding strong arrangements with direct links to the culture they studied, and other students finding music with limited connections, if any at all. This could be improved by providing structured repertoire lists for students to explore, rather than leaving students to independently

examine a whole website. There was also opportunity for more collaboration in this step, as many students researched the same culture, and therefore could have worked together in their search and analysis portion. This may have relieved some of the imbalance of search skills and lead to more repertoire being discovered and analyzed. A longer period of time provided for the project would have allowed an opportunity for a dedicated lesson on how to refine searches and use digital resources to build students' technology skills. However, it may be important to note that some teachers experience these same “keyword search frustrations.” If it is difficult to even find the multicultural repertoire, how can we begin to analyze and consider playing it?

We also had a limited number of resources and time to dedicate to this project. We only had access to and could play through arrangements available in our current music library. And as these were performance-based classes, we were simultaneously preparing for a concert. With more time, teachers could consider inviting guest speakers or experts in different musics to help students gain further perspective on various styles and performance traditions. Having students craft questions and engage with culture-bearers presents opportunities to deepen learning and understanding.

The next time I do this project, I will provide more time and practice to create a flowchart. This was the first time this type of assignment was used in the class. More practice with making flowcharts might have helped as preparation for this project. I would have us practice making a flowchart as a class, using the example of how to practice. We could go through how we normally assess our playing and turn it into a flowchart. It could start as, “Do we sound good, yes or no?” Then go through the questions we normally ask ourselves.

Additionally, while students were given time to get peer feedback for their flowcharts, it was in an informal setting, and did not have a strong protocol. Per the Gold Standard of PBL,

this could have been structured better to create a stronger public product with less variability. Unfortunately, this unit aligned with the end of the quarter, and time was not available to make these final adjustments. For the future, I would adjust the timeline to allow for a proper critique and feedback cycle before final publication of our projects.

Involving students in selecting repertoire for an instrumental ensemble provided opportunities for them to examine the need for cultural sensitivity. This project gave all students a chance to learn about music they may not regularly encounter, practice using music vocabulary and listening skills, and connect the work of our class to the real world. Using PBL Gold Standard practices helped engage students in extended inquiry and provided structure for the unit. It also investigated concerns about repertoire selection that are relevant to all music educators and musicians and leveraged student interest to build knowledge and help them grow as musicians and members of musical society. Students demonstrated learning all the way through and agreed that it was valuable and that they enjoyed this project (Post Questionnaire).

Students deserve a well-rounded music education that includes access to a diverse repertoire of listening and performing selections. Giving students the opportunity to explore the whole world of music through a critical lens of research and analysis of their own performance repertoire deepens their understanding of the differences in how music is shared in various cultures and provides high engagement and rigorous learning. Using the PBL model to drive student learning leads to higher engagement with the content, skills needed to be successful students, and deeper understanding. The world of music education is taking a more critical look at repertoire and effective practices for our students, and bringing students into the discussion can improve our practice.

REFERENCES

- Abramo, J. M. (2007). Mystery, fire, and intrigue representation and commodification of race in band literature. *Visions of Research in Music Education*, 9(1), 8.
<https://opencommons.uconn.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1061&context=vrme>
- Abril, C. R. (2006). Music that represents culture: selecting music with integrity. *Music Educators Journal*, 93(1), 38-45. <https://doi-org.unco.idm.oclc.org/10.1177/002743210609300122>
- Almulla, M. A. (2020). The Effectiveness of the Project-Based Learning (PBL) Approach as a Way to Engage Students in Learning. *SAGE Open*, 10(3).
<https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244020938702>
- Blumenfeld, P. C., Soloway, E., Marx, R. W., Krajcik, J., Guzdial, M., & Palincsar, A. S. (1991). Motivating Project-Based Learning: Sustaining the doing, supporting the learning. *Educational Psychologist*, 26(3-4), 369-398.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00461520.1991.9653139>
- Caponegro, J. (Composer). (2001). *Noche de Estrellas* [Sheet music]. Kendor Publishing.
- Carlow, R. (2016). Diva Irina: an English language learner in high school choir. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 170, 63-78.
<https://dialnet.unirioja.es/servlet/articulo?codigo=2351177>
- Carnegie Hall. (n.d.). *Musical explorers digital*.
<https://www.carnegiehall.org/Education/Programs/Musical-Explorers/Digital>
- Carter, N., Bryant-Lukosius, D., DiCenso, A., Blythe, J., & Neville, A. J. (2014). The use of triangulation in qualitative research. *Oncology Nursing Forum*, 41(5), 545-547.
<https://doi.org/10.1188/14.onf.545-547>

- Curnow, J. (Composer). (1992). *African Sketches* [Sheet music]. Hal Leonard.
- Emdin, C. (2016). *For white folks who teach in the hood. . . and the rest of y'all too: Reality pedagogy and urban education*. Beacon Press.
- Erickson, F. (2005). Culture in society and in educational practices. In J. Banks & C. A. M. Banks (Eds.), *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives* (5th ed., pp. 31–60). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley
- Evans, C. M. (2019). *Student outcomes from high-quality Project-Based Learning: A case study for PBLWorks*. National Center for the Improvement of Educational Assessment.
https://www.pblworks.org/sites/default/files/2020-01/PBLWorks%20HQPBL%20Teacher%20Case%20Study%20Report_FINAL.pdf
- Fitzpatrick, K. R. (2012). Cultural diversity and the formation of identity. *Music Educators Journal*, 98(4), 53–59. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0027432112442903>
- Gay, G. (2002). Preparing for culturally responsive teaching. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 53(2), 106-116. <https://doi-org.unco.idm.oclc.org/10.1177/0022487102053002003>
- Geier, R., Blumenfeld, P. C., Marx, R. W., Krajcik, J., Fishman, B. J., Soloway, E., & Clay-Chambers, J. (2008). Standardized test outcomes for students engaged in inquiry-based science curricula in the context of urban reform. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 45(8), 922–939. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tea.20248> *Gold Standard PBL: essential project design elements*. (2023). PBLWorks.
<https://www.pblworks.org/blog/gold-standard-pbl-essential-project-design-elements>
- Gurgel, R. (2019). The Tanglewood Symposium: popular music pedagogy from 1967 to today. *Music Educators Journal*, 105(3), 60–65. <https://doi-org.unco.idm.oclc.org/10.1177/0027432119831752>

- Hammond, Z. (2014). *Culturally Responsive Teaching and The Brain: Promoting Authentic Engagement and Rigor Among Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Students*. Corwin Press.
- Irizarry, J. G., & Raible, J. (2011). Beginning With *El Barrio*: Learning from exemplary teachers of Latino students. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 10(3), 186–203.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/15348431.2011.581102>
- John Johnson. (2017, March 1). *Maasai Dancers* [Video]. YouTube.
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JLDwn9Jo6Kg>
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1995a). But that’s just good teaching! The case for culturally relevant pedagogy. *Theory Into Practice, Digital/Theory Into Practice*, 34(3), 159–165.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00405849509543675>
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1995b). Toward a theory of culturally relevant pedagogy. *American Educational Research Journal*, 32(3), 465–491.
<https://doi.org/10.3102/00028312032003465>
- Lind, V. R., & McKoy, C. L. (2016). *Culturally Responsive teaching in music education: From Understanding to Application*.
- Maxwell, J. A. (2013). *Qualitative research design: An interactive approach* (3rd ed.). Sage.
- Miksza, P., Shaw, J. T., Richerme, L. K., Hash, P. M., & Hodges, D. A. (2023). *Music Education Research: An Introduction*. Oxford University Press, USA.
- Newbold, S. H. (Composer). (2008). *Irish Faire* [Sheet music]. FJH Music Company Inc.
- O’Brien, M. S. (Composer). (2013) *La Sortija* [Sheet music]. FJH Music Company Inc.

- Ozkan, Z. C. (2023). The effect of project-based learning in visual arts lesson on lesson outcomes and attitudes. *International Journal on Social and Education Sciences (IJonSES)*, 5(2), 367-380. <https://doi.org/10.46328/ijonSES.565>
- PBL Works. (2023, May 30). *Gold Standard PBL: essential project design elements*. <https://www.pblworks.org/blog/gold-standard-pbl-essential-project-design-elements>
- peakfiddler. (2015, March 13). *Irish Fiddle Jigs - Lannigans, Indian Point, Tenpenny Bit* [Video]. YouTube. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DJorMfp-jC0>
- Prest, A., Goble, J. S., & Vazquez-Cordoba, H. (2023). On Embedding Indigenous musics in schools: examining the applicability of possible models to one school district's approach. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education*, 41(2), 60-69. <https://doi-org.unco.idm.oclc.org/10.1177/87551233221085739>
- Sahli, R. (2017). An Examination of the Effectiveness of Project-Based Learning on Student Academic Achievement and Teacher Perceptions of Project-Based Learning (Order No. 10748735). Available from ProQuest One Academic; Publicly Available Content Database. (2026817186). <https://unco.idm.oclc.org/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/examination-effectiveness-project-based-learning/docview/2026817186/se-2>
- Shaw, J. T. (2015). "Knowing Their World" Urban choral music educators' knowledge of context. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 63(2), 198-223. <https://doi.org/10.2307/43900292>
- Shaw, J. T. (2016). "The Music I Was Meant to Sing" Adolescent choral students' perceptions of culturally responsive pedagogy. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 64(1), 45-70. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/43900326>

- Smith, R. W. (Composer). (1995). *The Tempest* [Sheet music]. Alfred Music Publishing
- The Tanglewood Symposium—Music in American Society. (1967). *Music Educators Journal*, 54(3), 49–49. <https://doi-org.unco.idm.oclc.org/10.2307/3391187>
- Taurins, J. A. (Composer). (2023). *Dark matter* [Sheet music]. Wingert-Jones Publications
- Volk, T. M. (1993). The History and development of multicultural music education as evidenced in the Music Educators Journal, 1967-1992. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 41(2), 137–155. <https://doi-org.unco.idm.oclc.org/10.2307/3345404>

APPENDIX A

**INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD LETTER, RECRUITMENT AND CONSENT
LETTERS**

IRB Exemption Letter



Date: 02/12/2024
Principal Investigator: Victoria Dimarzio
Committee Action: **IRB EXEMPT DETERMINATION – New Protocol**
Action Date: 02/12/2024
Protocol Number: [2402057088](#)
Protocol Title: Assessing Repertoire for Culturally Responsive Music Education
Expiration Date:

The University of Northern Colorado Institutional Review Board has reviewed your protocol and determined your project to be exempt under 45 CFR 46.104(d)(701) (702) for research involving

Category 2 (2018): EDUCATIONAL TESTS, SURVEYS, INTERVIEWS, OR OBSERVATIONS OF PUBLIC BEHAVIOR. Research that only includes interactions involving educational tests (cognitive, diagnostic, aptitude, achievement), survey procedures, interview procedures, or observation of public behavior (including visual or auditory recording) if at least one of the following criteria is met: (i) The information obtained is recorded by the investigator in such a manner that the identity of the human subjects cannot readily be ascertained, directly or through identifiers linked to the subjects; (ii) Any disclosure of the human subjects' responses outside the research would not reasonably place the subjects at risk of criminal or civil liability or be damaging to the subjects' financial standing, employability, educational advancement, or reputation; or (iii) The information obtained is recorded by the investigator in such a manner that the identity of the human subjects can readily be ascertained, directly or through identifiers linked to the subjects, and an IRB conducts a limited IRB review to make the determination required by 45 CFR 46.111(a)(7).

You may begin conducting your research as outlined in your protocol. Your study does not require further review from the IRB, unless changes need to be made to your approved protocol.

As the Principal Investigator (PI), you are still responsible for contacting the UNC IRB office if and when:



- You wish to deviate from the described protocol and would like to formally submit a modification request. Prior IRB approval must be obtained before any changes can be implemented (except to eliminate an immediate hazard to research participants).
- You make changes to the research personnel working on this study (add or drop research staff on this protocol).
- At the end of the study or before you leave The University of Northern Colorado and are no longer a student or employee, to request your protocol be closed. *You cannot continue to reference UNC on any documents (including the informed consent form) or conduct the study under the auspices of UNC if you are no longer a student/employee of this university.
- You have received or have been made aware of any complaints, problems, or adverse events that are related or possibly related to participation in the research.

If you have any questions, please contact the Interim IRB Administrator, Chris Saxton, at 970-702-5427 or via e-mail at chris.saxton@unco.edu. Additional information concerning the requirements for the protection of human subjects may be found at the Office of Human Research Protection website - <http://hhs.gov/ohrp/> and <https://www.unco.edu/research/research-integrity-and-compliance/institutional-review-board/>.

Sincerely,
Michael Aldridge
Interim IRB Administrator

University of Northern Colorado: FWA00000784

Recruitment letter



Project announcement

We are going to work on a 4-week class project exploring culturally responsive music education. The purpose of this project is to explore ways we learn about global music, and how we can best experience music from varied cultures.

The project will include various assignments, group discussion, and recording classes. I am seeking to use some of these collected materials as data for my master's thesis project. All data collected will be treated with strict confidentiality. If you consent to have your materials used as data, you will be given a pseudonym and your personal identity will be kept anonymous throughout the case study. Data collected will only be used for research purposes and will be reported in an anonymized form. The data will only be accessible to the researcher (Victoria DiMarzio) and thesis advisor (Dr. Krissie Weimer), kept on a password protected computer. To be eligible to participate in this case study, you must be a current eighth grade music student at Merrill Middle school.

Anuncio del proyecto

Vamos a trabajar en un proyecto de clase de 4 semanas que explora la educación musical culturalmente receptiva. El propósito de este proyecto es explorar formas en que aprendemos sobre la música global y cómo podemos experimentar mejor la música de diversas culturas.

El proyecto incluirá varias tareas, discusiones grupales y clases de grabación. Estoy buscando utilizar algunos de estos materiales recopilados como datos para mi proyecto de tesis de maestría. Todos los datos recogidos serán tratados con estricta confidencialidad. Si acepta que sus materiales se utilicen como datos, se le asignará un seudónimo y su identidad personal se mantendrá anónima durante todo el estudio de caso. Los datos recopilados solo se utilizarán con fines de investigación y se informarán de forma anónima. Los datos solo serán accesibles para la investigadora (Victoria DiMarzio) y la asesora de tesis (Dra. Krissie Weimer), y se mantendrán en una computadora protegida con contraseña. Para ser elegible para participar en este estudio de caso, debe ser un estudiante de música de octavo grado en la escuela secundaria Merrill.



اعلام پروژه

ما قرار است روی یک پروژه کلاسی 4 هفته ای کار کنیم که آموزش موسیقی پاسخگوی فرهنگی را بررسی می کند. هدف از این پروژه کشف راههایی است که در مورد موسیقی جهانی یاد می گیریم و اینکه چگونه می توانیم موسیقی را از فرهنگهای مختلف به بهترین شکل تجربه کنیم.

این پروژه شامل تکالیف مختلف، بحث گروهی و کلاس های ضبط خواهد بود. من به دنبال استفاده از برخی از این مطالب جمع آوری شده به عنوان داده برای پروژه پایان نامه کارشناسی ارشد خود هستم. تمام داده های جمع آوری شده با محرمانه بودن کامل رفتار خواهد شد. اگر موافقت کنید که از مطالب خود به عنوان داده استفاده شود، یک نام مستعار به شما داده می شود و هویت شخصی شما در طول مطالعه موردی ناشناس باقی می ماند. داده های جمع آوری شده فقط برای اهداف پژوهشی مورد استفاده قرار می گیرد و به صورت ناشناس گزارش می شود. داده ها فقط برای محقق (ویکتوریا دیمارزیو) و مشاور پایان نامه (دکتر کریسی وایمر) قابل دسترسی خواهند بود که در رایانه ای با رمز عبور محافظت می شوند. برای اینکه واجد شرایط شرکت در این مطالعه موردی باشید، باید دانش آموز کلاس هشتم موسیقی فعلی در مدرسه راهنمایی مریل باشید.

اعلان المشروع

سنعمل علی مشروع دراسي مدته 4 أسابيع لاستكشاف تعليم الموسيقى المستجيب ثقافيًا. الغرض من هذا المشروع هو استكشاف الطرق التي نتعلم بها عن الموسيقى العالمية، وكيف يمكننا تجربة الموسيقى من الثقافات المتنوعة بشكل أفضل.

سيتم تضمين المشروع مهام مختلفة ومناقشة جماعية ودروس تسجيل. أسمى لاستخدام بعض هذه المواد التي تم جمعها كبيانات لمشروع أطروحتي للماجستير. سيتم التعامل مع جميع البيانات التي تم جمعها بسرية تامة. إذا وافقت على استخدام المواد الخاصة بك كبيانات، فسيتم إعطاؤك اسمًا مستعارًا وستظل هويتك الشخصية مجهولة طوال فترة دراسة الحالة. لن يتم استخدام البيانات التي تم جمعها إلا لأغراض البحث وسيتم الإبلاغ عنها في نموذج مجهول المصدر. لن يتمكن من الوصول إلى البيانات سوى الباحثة (فيكتوريا ديمارزيو) ومشرف الأطروحة (الدكتورة كريسي فايمر)، المحفوظة على جهاز كمبيوتر محمي بكلمة مرور. لكي تكون مؤهلاً للمشاركة في دراسة الحالة هذه، يجب أن تكون طالب موسيقى حاليًا في الصف الثامن في مدرسة ميريل المتوسطة.

Consent form



Informed Consent Form for Participation in Research

Title of Research Study: Assessing Repertoire for Culturally Responsive Music Education

Researcher(s): Victoria DiMarzio, School of Music

Phone Number: (303) 319-1598 email: victoria_dimarzio@dpsk12.net

Research Advisor: Dr. Krissie Weimer

email: kristina.weimer@unco.edu

Procedures: We would like to ask your student to participate in a research study. The purpose of this study is to explore student perceptions of how global music is learned, and how students can best experience music from cultures different from their own. Students will partake in a unit of study, lasting 4 weeks of instruction, where they will research music from around the world, and compare original works to arrangements made for our ensemble. If you agree to allow your student to participate in this study their completed assignments and discussion responses will be collected as data. All data collected will be treated with strict confidentiality. Your student will be given a pseudonym and their personal identity will be kept anonymous. Data obtained will be used solely for research purposes and will be reported in an aggregated and anonymized form. The data will only be accessible to the researcher (Victoria DiMarzio) and thesis advisor (Dr. Krissie Weimer).

Questions: If you have any questions about this research project, please feel free to contact Victoria DiMarzio at victoria_dimarzio@dpsk12.net. If you have any concerns about your selection or treatment as a research participant, please contact the University of Northern Colorado IRB at irb@unco.edu or 970-351-1910.

Voluntary Participation: Please understand that your student's participation is voluntary. You may decide not to allow them to participate in this study and if they begin participation you may still decide for them to stop and withdraw them at any time. Your decision will be respected and your student will not result in loss of benefits to which they are otherwise entitled.

Please take all the time you need to read through this document and decide whether you would like your student to participate in this research study.

If you agree to allow your student to participate in this research study, please sign below. You will be given a copy of this form for your records.



Student Participant Name

Participant Parent/Guardian Signature Date

Investigator Signature Date



Formulario de Consentimiento Informado para Participación en Investigación

Título del estudio de investigación: Evaluación del repertorio para una educación musical culturalmente receptiva

Investigador(es): Victoria DiMarzio, Escuela de Música

Número de teléfono: (303) 319-1598 correo electrónico: victoria_dimarzio@dpsk12.net

Asesor de investigación: Dr. Krissie Weimer
correo electrónico:kristina.weimer@unco.edu

Procedimientos: Nos gustaría pedirle a su estudiante que participe en un estudio de investigación. El propósito de este estudio es explorar las percepciones de los estudiantes sobre cómo se aprende música global y cómo los estudiantes pueden experimentar mejor la música de culturas diferentes a la suya. Los estudiantes participarán en una unidad de estudio, que durará 4 semanas de instrucción, donde investigarán música de todo el mundo y compararán obras originales con arreglos hechos para nuestro conjunto. Si acepta permitir que su estudiante participe en este estudio, sus tareas completadas y las respuestas de las discusiones se recopilarán como datos. Todos los datos recogidos serán tratados con estricta confidencialidad. A su estudiante se le asignará un seudónimo y su identidad personal se mantendrá anónima. Los datos obtenidos se utilizarán únicamente con fines de investigación y se informarán de forma agregada y anónima. Los datos solo serán accesibles para la investigadora (Victoria DiMarzio) y la asesora de tesis (Dra. Krissie Weimer).

Preguntas: Si tiene alguna pregunta sobre este proyecto de investigación, no dude en comunicarse con Victoria DiMarzio en victoria_dimarzio@dpsk12.net. Si tienes algún inquietudes sobre su selección o tratamiento como participante de la investigación, comuníquese con el IRB de la Universidad del Norte de Colorado en irb@unco.edu o al 970-351-1910.

Participación voluntaria: Por favor comprenda que la participación de su estudiante es voluntaria. Tú puede decidir no permitirles participar en este estudio y, si comienzan a participar, usted aún puede decidir que lo detengan y lo retiren en cualquier momento. Su decisión será respetada y su estudiante no resultará en la pérdida de los beneficios a los que de otro modo tendría derecho.

Tómese todo el tiempo que necesite para leer este documento y decida si desea que su estudiante participe en este estudio de investigación.



Si acepta permitir que su estudiante participe en este estudio de investigación, firme a continuación. Se le entregará una copia de este formulario para sus registros.

Nombre del estudiante participante

Firma del padre/tutor del participante Fecha

Firma del investigador

Fecha



فرم رضایت آگاهانه برای مشارکت در پژوهش

عنوان پژوهش: ارزیابی رپرتوار برای آموزش موسیقی پاسخگویی فرهنگی

محقق(ها): ویکتوریا دیمارزیو، دانشکده موسیقی

victoria_dimarzio@dpsk12.net: شماره تلفن: (303) 1598-319 ایمیل

مشاور پژوهشی: دکتر کریسی وایمر

kristina.weimer@unco.edu: شماره تلفن

رویه ها: ما از دانش آموز شما می خواهیم که در یک مطالعه تحقیقاتی شرکت کند. هدف از این مطالعه بررسی ادراکات دانش آموزان از نحوه یادگیری موسیقی جهانی و اینکه چگونه دانش آموزان می توانند موسیقی را از فرهنگ های متفاوت از فرهنگ خودشان به بهترین شکل تجربه کنند، است. دانش آموزان در یک واحد مطالعه شرکت می کنند که 4 هفته به طول می انجامد، جایی که در مورد موسیقی از سراسر جهان تحقیق می کنند و آثار اصلی را با ترتیب هایی که برای گروه ما ساخته شده است مقایسه می کنند. اگر موافقت کنید که به دانش آموز خود اجازه دهید در این مطالعه شرکت کند، تکالیف تکمیل شده و پاسخ های بحث و گفتگو به عنوان داده جمع آوری می شود. تمام داده های جمع آوری شده با محرمانه بودن کامل رفتار خواهد شد. به دانش آموز شما یک نام مستعار داده می شود و هویت شخصی او ناشناس باقی می ماند. داده های بدست آمده صرفاً برای اهداف پژوهشی مورد استفاده قرار می گیرد و به صورت تجمیع شده و ناشناس گزارش می شود. داده ها فقط برای محقق (ویکتوریا دیمارزیو) و مشاور پایان نامه (دکتر کریسی وایمر) قابل دسترسی خواهند بود.

سوالات: اگر سؤالی در مورد این پروژه تحقیقاتی دارید، لطفاً آن را مطرح کنید تماس بگیرید. اگر دارید victoria_dimarzio@dpsk12.net با ویکتوریا دیمارزیو در نگرانی در مورد انتخاب یا درمان خود به عنوان یک شرکت کننده در تحقیق، لطفاً با یا 1910-351-970 در irb@unco.edu در IRB دانشگاه شمال کلرادو

مشارکت داوطلبانه: لطفاً درک کنید که مشارکت دانش آموز شما داوطلبانه است. شما ممکن است تصمیم بگیرید که به آنها اجازه شرکت در این مطالعه را ندهید و اگر شرکت را شروع کردند، همچنان ممکن است تصمیم بگیرید که آنها را متوقف کرده و در هر زمانی آنها را پس بگیرید. به تصمیم شما احترام گذاشته می شود و دانش آموز شما منجر به از دست دادن مزایایی نخواهد شد که در غیر این صورت مستحق آن هستند.

لطفاً تمام زمان لازم را برای مطالعه این سند اختصاص دهید و تصمیم بگیرید که آیا مایلید دانش آموز شما در این مطالعه تحقیقاتی شرکت کند یا خیر.

اگر موافقت می کنید که به دانش آموز خود اجازه دهید در این مطالعه تحقیقاتی شرکت کند، لطفاً در زیر ثبت نام کنید. یک کپی از این فرم برای سوابق به شما داده می شود.



نام شرکت کننده دانش آموز

تاریخ امضای والدین/سرپرست شرکت کننده

امضای بازپرس

تاریخ

APPENDIX B

LANGUAGE SUPPORTS

Vocabulary Note Catchers
Non-ELL student

Appreciation vs Appropriation Vocabulary	
Word	Definition
Appreciation	1) 2)
Appropriation	
culture	
Tradition	
Representation	
Arrangement	1) 2)

ELL student

Appreciation vs Appropriation Vocabulary	
Word	Definition
Appreciation	1) _____ and enjoyment of the good qualities of someone or something 2) A full understanding of a _____
Appropriation	The action of taking something for one's own use, typically without the owner's _____
culture	The _____, _____, social Institutions, and achievements of a particular people or social group
Tradition	The handing down of information, beliefs or _____
Representation	The description or _____ of someone or something
Arrangement	1) The art of giving an existing melody _____ 2) The _____ of a composition to fit a different medium (_____) other than the original

APPENDIX C

STUDENT WORK TEMPLATES AND DATA COLLECTION

Pre Project Questionnaire

Cultural Appre vs Appro Pre Assessment

* Indicates required question

1. Last Name *

2. First Name *

3. How important do you think it is for musicians to be familiar with music from world cultures? *

Mark only one oval.

1 2 3 4
Not Very Important

4. How familiar are you with music from cultures different from your own? *

Mark only one oval.

1 2 3 4
Not Very Familiar

5. How interested are you in learning about/how to play music from world cultures? *

Mark only one oval.

1 2 3 4
Not Very Interested

6. Do you think people can perform music of a different culture than their own? Why or why not? *

7. Do you feel like you/your culture are well represented in our class? *

Mark only one oval.

Yes
 No
 Maybe
 Other: _____

8. Do you feel like you belong in our class? Why or why not *

9. List types of music you are most familiar with *

This content is neither created nor endorsed by Google.

Google Forms

Post Project Questionnaire

Cultural Appre vs Appro Post Assessment

* Indicates required question

1. Last Name *

2. First Name *

3. How important do you think it is for musicians to be familiar with music from world cultures? *

Mark only one oval.

1 2 3 4

Not Very Important

4. How familiar are you with music from cultures different from your own? *

Mark only one oval.

1 2 3 4

Not Very Familiar

5. How interested are you in learning about/how to play music from world cultures? *

Mark only one oval.

1 2 3 4
Not Very Interested

6. Do you think people can perform music of a different culture than their own? Why or why not? *

7. Do you feel like you/your culture are well represented in our class? *

Mark only one oval.

Yes
 No
 Maybe
 Other: _____

-
8. Has your sense of belonging in our class changed as a result of this project? In what way? *

9. What do you want others to know about this topic? *

10. What suggestions do you have for Mx. DiMarzio to improve this unit?

This content is neither created nor endorsed by Google.

Google Forms

Research Note Catcher One

World Music Research Project

Go to [Carnegie Hall's Music Explorer's](#) (CHME) and pick a region to research.

General info

Region of music	
Why I want to learn about this region's music	
Name and background of Expert	
Influences on style	
Languages used	
Instruments used	
Key stylistic features	

Connections

How is this music similar to what we play in class?	In your answer, pick vocab from both lists: Comparison vocab: same, similar, different, differs, like, akin to, both, neither
Answer:	
How does this music differ from what we play in class?	Music vocab: style, dynamics, tempo, rhythm, beat, instrument (list all), syncopation, even, melody/melodic, harmony/harmonic, ensemble
Answer:	

Further research

Where can you find more information about this style of music?	
Are there students/staff members at our school that could give you insight on this style of music?	
Are there good arrangements for our class to play this style in a respectful way? (paste	

links)	
What would you listen/look for in arrangements for our instruments to know it is respectful?	

Research Note Catcher Two

World Music Research Project: Part 2

Using a site below, search for music made for our class that matches the region of music you studied last week. Complete the chart for at least 2 pieces of music.

Piece 1

Region of music	
Title of Arrangement	
Link	
Name of Composer	
Composer background (where did they study, where are they from, do they have cultural knowledge to write this style?)	
Is the work inspired by, or does it actually represent the culture? (How do you know?)	
Key stylistic features	

Piece 2

Region of music	
Title of Arrangement	
Link	
Name of Composer	
Composer background	
Is the work inspired by, or does it actually represent the culture? (How do you know?)	

Key stylistic features	
------------------------	--

Piece 3 (optional)

Region of music	
Title of Arrangement	
Link	
Name of Composer	
Composer background	
Is the work inspired by, or does it actually represent the culture? (How do you know?)	
Key stylistic features	

Article comparison Note catcher

Appreciation vs Appropriation Article Notecatcher	
Key Words	
Summarize	
Stand out Quotes	

Appreciation vs Appropriation Comparison Discussion	
similarities	
differences	
Group Definition	Cultural Appreciation: Cultural Appropriation:

APPENDIX D

FINAL PROJECT TEMPLATE

Flowchart slides

Appreciation vs Appropriation

Directions

1. Share your definition of appreciation vs appropriation
2. Make a flowchart to help others understand when arrangements are appreciation and when they are appropriation
3. Demonstrate using your flowchart with an arrangement from your research. Include evidence from original cultural music research.
4. Explain what you learned through the research process
5. Add example arrangements, original music, pictures, links, backgrounds to make the presentation visually pleasing

(you may delete this slide **after** completing)

Definition

Cultural Appreciation:

Cultural Appropriation:

Flow Chart

Flowchart in Action (Research Results)

(Info on region of music you studied)

(Arrangement from research part 2)

Summary of Learning

By participating in this project, I have learned...

After doing this research, my perspective on performing multicultural music...

The most important thing to remember is...